#### 2A:84A-32

#### LEGISLATIVE HISTORY CHECKLIST

Compiled by the NJ State Law Library

**LAWS OF:** 2001 **CHAPTER:** 377

NJSA: 2A:84A-32 (Post conviction DNA testing)
BILL NO: S1920 (Substituted for A3996)

SPONSOR(S): Martin and O'Connor

DATE INTRODUCED: December 4, 2000

COMMITTEE: ASSEMBLY: Judiciary

SENATE: Judiciary

AMENDED DURING PASSAGE: Yes

**DATE OF PASSAGE:** ASSEMBLY: January 7, 2002

SENATE: November 26, 2001

**DATE OF APPROVAL:** January 8 2002

FOLLOWING ARE ATTACHED IF AVAILABLE:
FINAL TEXT OF BILL 2nd reprint enacted

(Amendments during passage denoted by superscript numbers)

S1920

SPONSORS STATEMENT: (Begins on page 5 of original bill)

COMMITTEE STATEMENT:

SENATE:

Yes

FLOOR AMENDMENT STATEMENTS:

LEGISLATIVE FISCAL ESTIMATE:

Yes

A3996

SPONSORS STATEMENT: (Begins on page 4 of original bill)

Yes

COMMITTEE STATEMENT: ASSEMBLY: Yes

SENATE: No

FLOOR AMENDMENT STATEMENTS:
LEGISLATIVE FISCAL ESTIMATE:
Yes
VETO MESSAGE:
No
GOVERNOR'S PRESS RELEASE ON SIGNING:
No

**FOLLOWING WERE PRINTED:** 

To check for circulating copies, contact New Jersey State Government

Publications at the State Library (609) 278-2640 ext.103 or <a href="mailto:refdesk@njstatelib.org">mailto:refdesk@njstatelib.org</a>
REPORTS:
No
HEARINGS:
No
NEWSPAPER ARTICLES:
No

See: California law, as mentioned in statutes.

## **SENATE, No. 1920**

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY

## 209th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED DECEMBER 4, 2000

**Sponsored by:** 

**Senator ROBERT J. MARTIN** 

District 26 (Essex, Morris and Passaic)

Senator EDWARD T. O'CONNOR, JR.

District 31 (Hudson)

#### **SYNOPSIS**

Provides for postconviction DNA testing under certain circumstances.

#### **CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT**

As introduced.



(Sponsorship Updated As Of: 6/29/2001)

1 AN ACT concerning certain testing of evidence and supplementing 2 Title 2A and Title 53 of the New Jersey Statutes.

**BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

- 1. a. Any person who was convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make a motion before the trial court that entered the judgment of conviction for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- (1) The motion shall be verified by the convicted person under penalty of perjury and shall do all of the following:
  - (a) explain why the identity of the defendant was or should have been a significant issue in the case;
  - (b) explain in light of all the evidence, how the requested DNA testing would raise a reasonable probability that the convicted person's verdict or sentence would be more favorable if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the time of conviction; and
  - (c) make every reasonable attempt to identify both the evidence that should be tested and the specific type of DNA testing sought.
  - (2) Notice of the motion shall be served on the Attorney General, the prosecutor in the county of conviction, and if known, the governmental agency or laboratory holding the evidence sought to be tested. Responses, if any, shall be filed within 60 days of the date on which the Attorney General or the prosecutor are served with the motion, unless a continuance is granted.
  - (3) If any DNA or other biological evidence testing was conducted previously by either the prosecution or defense, the results of that testing shall be revealed in the motion for testing, if known. If evidence was subjected to DNA or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the prosecution or defense to provide all parties and the court with access to the laboratory reports, underlying data, and laboratory notes prepared in connection with the DNA testing.
  - b. The court, in its discretion, may order a hearing on the motion. The motion shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial unless the presiding judge determines that judge is unavailable. Upon request of either party, the court may order, in the interest of justice, that the convicted person be present at the hearing of the motion.
  - c. The court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person who brings a motion pursuant this section if that person is indigent.
- d. The court shall grant the motion for DNA testing if it determines all of the following have been established:
- 44 (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition that 45 would permit the DNA testing that is requested in the motion.

- 1 (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody 2 sufficient to establish it has not been substituted, tampered with, 3 replaced or altered in any material aspect.
  - (3) the identity of the defendant was or should have been a significant issue int he case.
  - (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of the convicted person's identity as the offender of or accomplice to the crime, special circumstance, or enhancement allegation that resulted in the conviction or sentence.
  - (5) the requested DNA testing result would raise a reasonable probability that, in light of all the evidence, the convicted person's verdict or sentence would have been more favorable if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the time of conviction. The court in its discretion may consider any evidence whether or not it was introduced at trial.
- 17 (6) The evidence sought to be tested meets either of the following conditions:
  - (a) it was not tested previously;

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

2021

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

3334

39

- (b) it was tested previously, but the requested DNA test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or accomplice or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior test results.
- (7) The testing requested employs a method generally accepted within the relevant scientific community.
  - (8) The motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- e. If the court grants the motion for DNA testing, the court order shall identify the specific evidence to be tested and the DNA technology to be used. The testing shall be conducted by a laboratory mutually agreed upon by the prosecutor, the Attorney General and the person filing the motion. If the parties cannot agree, the court's order shall designate the laboratory to conduct the testing and shall consider designating a laboratory accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board.
- f. The result of any testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be fully disclosed to the person filing the motion, the prosecutor and the Attorney General. If requested by any party, the court shall order production of the underlying laboratory data and notes.
  - g. The costs of the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be borne by the State.
- h. An order granting or denying a motion for DNA testing pursuant to this section may be appealed, pursuant to Rules of Court. Any such appeal shall be filed within 20 days after the court's order granting or denying the motion for DNA testing.
- i. DNA testing ordered by the court pursuant to this section shall be done as soon as practicable. However, if the court finds that a

miscarriage of justice will otherwise occur and that it is necessary in the interests of justice to give priority to the DNA testing, a DNA laboratory shall be required to give priority to the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section over the laboratory's other pending casework.

j. DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to a motion for postconviction DNA testing pursuant to this section is exempt from any law requiring disclosure of information to the public.

9 10 11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

2526

27

2829

3031

32

33

6

- 2. a. Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary and subject to subsection b. of this section, the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety shall retain any biological material secured in connection with a criminal case for the period of time that the convicted person remains incarcerated in connection with the case. The material shall be stored and maintained in the State DNA databank established pursuant to the "DNA Database and Databank Act of 1994," P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.17 et seq.). The division shall have the discretion to determine how the evidence is retained pursuant to this section, provided that the evidence is retained in a condition suitable for DNA testing.
- b. The division may dispose of biological material before the expiration of the period of time described in subsection a. if all the conditions set forth below are met:
- (1) The division notifies all of the following persons of the provisions of this section and of the intention of the division to dispose of the material: any person who as a result of a conviction in the case is currently serving a term of imprisonment and who remains incarcerated in connection with the case; any counsel of record; the public defender in the county of the conviction; the prosecutor in the county of the conviction and the Attorney General.
- (2) The division does not receive, within 90 days of sending the notification, any of the following:
- 34 (a) A copy of the motion filed pursuant to section 1 of P.L.
- 35 c., (C.) (now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this 36 bill), however, upon filing of that motion, the division shall retain the 37 material only until the time that the court's denial of the motion is 38 final.
- 39 (b) A sworn request that the material not be destroyed or disposed 40 of because the declarant will file within 180 days a motion for DNA 41 testing pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill) that is followed within 42 180 days by a copy of the motion for DNA testing pursuant to section 43 44 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as 45 section 1 of this bill), unless a request for an extension is requested by the convicted person and agreed to by the governmental entity in 46

#### S1920 MARTIN, O'CONNOR

1 possession of the evidence.

the parties involved.

- (c) A copy of a sworn declaration of innocence that has been filed with the court within 180 days of the judgment of conviction. However, the court shall permit the destruction of the evidence upon a showing that the declaration is false or there is no issue of identity that would be affected by additional testing. The convicted person may be cross-examined on the declaration at any hearing conducted pursuant to this section or on an application by or on behalf of the convicted person pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill).
- (3) No other provision of law requires that biological evidence be preserved or retained.
- c. The division shall adopt rules governing the procedures to be used in the analysis and storage of DNA samples and DNA testing results submitted pursuant to P.L. c., (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as this bill).

3. The Supreme Court of New Jersey may adopt rules appropriate and necessary to effectuate the purpose of this act.

4. This act shall take effect on the 120th day after enactment.

#### STATEMENT

This bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing under specified conditions. The bill requires the motion to include: an explanation as to why the convicted person's identity was or should have been a significant issue in the case; an explanation as to how the DNA testing would raise a reasonable probability that the sentence would have been more favorable if the DNA testing had been available at the trial which resulted in the conviction; and to make a reasonable attempt to identify the evidence to be tested and the type of DNA testing sought. The motion would also have to include the results of any previous conducted DNA testing. If any previous tests were conducted the court can order that access to the reports, data and

The bill provides that the court shall grant the motion for DNA testing if it determines that: (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition to be tested; (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not be tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect; (3) the identity of the defendant was or should have been a significant issue

notes in connection with the previous DNA tests be provided to all

#### S1920 MARTIN, O'CONNOR

6

- in the case; (4) there is a prima facie showing that the evidence sought is material to the issue of the convicted person's identity as the offender of or accomplice to the crime, special circumstances or enhancement allegation that resulted in the conviction; (5) the DNA testing results would raise a reasonable probability that the convicted person's sentence would have been more favorable if the results had been available; (6) the evidence sought either has not been tested
- 9 are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the 10 offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior tests 11 results; (7) the testing employs a method which is generally accepted

previously or it has been tested but the test would provide results that

- and (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- The bill provides that the costs of the test would be borne by the State.

  The bill would also require the Division of State Police in the
- The bill would also require the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety to store the DNA testing results for the period of time that the applicant remains incarcerated in connection with the case.
- 19 This bill is modeled after a recently enacted law in California.

#### SENATE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE

#### STATEMENT TO

**SENATE, No. 1920** 

with committee amendments

### STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**DATED: JUNE 28, 2001** 

The Senate Judiciary Committee reports favorably and with committee amendments Senate Bill No. 1920.

This bill establishes procedures for post-conviction DNA testing. Section 1 of the bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing. The committee amended this section of the bill to clarify that the motion should do all of the following: (1) explain why the identity of the convicted person's was a significant issue in the case; (2) explain, in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based would be granted; (3) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial; (4) make a reasonable attempt to identify the evidence to be tested and the type of DNA testing sought; and (5) include a consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing. In addition, if there were any previous DNA testing conducted, the motion would also have to include the results of those tests.

In addition, the amendments provide that, if any DNA testing is ordered, the Attorney General or prosecutor may recommend a particular type of testing be conducted.

The committee also amended the bill to clarify that the court could not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines that all of the following conditions have been established: (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition to be tested; (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not be tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect; (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case; (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of identity; (5) the requested DNA testing results would raise a reasonable probability, if the results were

favorable to the defendant, that a motion for a new trial based upon the newly discovered evidence would be granted; (6) the evidence sought either has not been previously tested or it has been previously tested but the requested test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior tests results; (7) the testing employs a method which is generally accepted and (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.

The bill was also amended by the committee to clarify that the DNA tests would be conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if the laboratory was unable to perform the testing at a lab that was accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance. In addition, the amendments provide that the costs of the test would be borne by the convicted person.

More importantly, the committee amended the bill to provide that all post-conviction DNA profile information obtained from a convicted person could be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes. The amendments also delete subsection b. of the bill which would have authorized the Division of State Police to dispose of the DNA profile information.

The remaining committee amendments were technical in nature including giving the rule-making authority to the Attorney General instead of the Division of State Police and amending the effective date.

# [First Reprint] SENATE, No. 1920

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY 209th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED DECEMBER 4, 2000

Sponsored by:

Senator ROBERT J. MARTIN
District 26 (Essex, Morris and Passaic)
Senator EDWARD T. O'CONNOR, JR.
District 31 (Hudson)

Co-Sponsored by:

Senators Himelman, Allen and Sacco

#### **SYNOPSIS**

Provides for post-conviction DNA testing; allows post-conviction DNA profile information to be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes

#### **CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT**

As reported by the Senate Judiciary Committee on June 28, 2001, with amendments.



(Sponsorship Updated As Of: 11/27/2001)

1 AN ACT concerning certain testing of evidence and supplementing 2 Title 2A and Title 53 of the New Jersey Statutes.

3

4 **BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

6 7

8

9

10

13 14

15

16

17 18

19

20

- 1. a. Any person who was convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make a motion before the trial court that entered the judgment of conviction for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- 11 (1) The motion shall be verified by the convicted person under 12 penalty of perjury and shall do all of the following:
  - (a) explain why the identity of the defendant was <sup>1</sup>[or should have been] <sup>1</sup> a significant issue in the case;
  - (b) explain in light of all the evidence, how <sup>1</sup>if the results of <sup>1</sup> the requested DNA testing <sup>1</sup>[would raise a reasonable probability that the convicted person's verdict or sentence would be more] are <sup>1</sup> favorable <sup>1</sup>[if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the time of conviction; and] to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted; <sup>1</sup>
- (c) <sup>1</sup>explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, 21 whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for 22 23 DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility 24 of DNA testing evidence at trial. If evidence was subjected to DNA 25 or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the 26 defense, the court shall order the prosecution or defense to provide 27 all parties and the court with access to the laboratory reports, 28 underlying data and laboratory notes prepared in connection with the 29 DNA testing; <sup>1</sup>
- 30 (d) make every reasonable attempt to identify both the evidence 31 that should be tested and the specific type of DNA testing sought <sup>1</sup>:and
- (e) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA
   testing<sup>1</sup>.
- 34 (2) Notice of the motion shall be served on the Attorney General, 35 the prosecutor in the county of conviction, and if known, the 36 governmental agency or laboratory holding the evidence sought to be 37 tested. Responses, if any, shall be filed within 60 days of the date on which the Attorney General <sup>1</sup>[or] and <sup>1</sup> the prosecutor are served with 38 39 the motion, unless a continuance is granted. <sup>1</sup>The Attorney General or prosecutor may support the motion for DNA testing or oppose it with 40 41 a statement of reasons and may recommend to the court that if any

EXPLANATION - Matter enclosed in bold-faced brackets [thus] in the above bill is not enacted and intended to be omitted in the law.

Matter underlined thus is new matter.

Matter enclosed in superscript numerals has been adopted as follows:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Senate SJU committee amendments adopted June 28, 2001.

1 DNA testing is ordered, a particular type of testing be conducted.<sup>1</sup>

- 2 <sup>1</sup>[(3) If any DNA or other biological evidence testing was 3 conducted previously by either the prosecution or defense, the results 4 of that testing shall be revealed in the motion for testing, if known. If 5 evidence was subjected to DNA or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the 6 7 prosecution or defense to provide all parties and the court with access 8 to the laboratory reports, underlying data, and laboratory notes 9 prepared in connection with the DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup>
  - b. The court, in its discretion, may order a hearing on the motion. The motion shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial unless the presiding judge determines that judge is unavailable. Upon request of either party, the court may order, in the interest of justice, that the convicted person be present at the hearing of the motion.

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

25

26

27

28

29

3031

- c. The court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person who brings a motion pursuant this section if that person is indigent.
- d. The court shall <sup>1</sup>not<sup>1</sup> grant the motion for DNA testing <sup>1</sup>[if]unless, after conducting a hearing, <sup>1</sup> it determines <sup>1</sup>that <sup>1</sup> all of the following have been established:
- (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition that would permit the DNA testing that is requested in the motion <sup>1</sup>[.]:<sup>1</sup>
- 22 (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody 23 sufficient to establish it has not been substituted, tampered with, 24 replaced or altered in any material aspect <sup>1</sup>[.]:<sup>1</sup>
  - (3) the identity of the defendant was <sup>1</sup>[or should have been] <sup>1</sup> a significant issue <sup>1</sup>[int he] in the <sup>1</sup> case <sup>1</sup>[.]; <sup>1</sup>
  - (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of the convicted person's identity as the offender <sup>1</sup>[of or accomplice to the crime, special circumstance, or enhancement allegation that resulted in the conviction or sentence.]:
- (5) the requested DNA testing result would raise a reasonable 32 33 probability that <sup>1</sup>[, in light of all the evidence, the convicted person's verdict or sentence would have been more] if the results were<sup>1</sup> 34 favorable <sup>1</sup>[ if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the 35 36 time of conviction] to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted<sup>1</sup>. The court in its 37 38 discretion may consider any evidence whether or not it was introduced at trial <sup>1</sup>[.]:<sup>1</sup> 39
- 40 (6) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> evidence sought to be tested meets either of the following conditions:
  - (a) it was not tested previously;
- 43 (b) it was tested previously, but the requested DNA test would 44 provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative 45 of the identity of the offender <sup>1</sup>[or accomplice] <sup>1</sup> or have a reasonable

- probability of contradicting prior test results <sup>1</sup>[.]; <sup>1</sup> 1
- (7) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> testing requested employs a method generally 2 accepted within the relevant scientific community <sup>1</sup>[.]; and <sup>1</sup> 3
  - (8) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- 5 e. If the court grants the motion for DNA testing, the court order 6 shall identify the specific evidence to be tested and the DNA
- 7 technology to be used. The testing shall be conducted <sup>1</sup>by the New
- Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if that laboratory 8
- is unable to perform the testing, at 1 a laboratory 1 [mutually agreed 9
- 10 upon by the prosecutor, the Attorney General and the person filing the
- motion. If the parties cannot agree, the court's order shall designate 11
- 12 the laboratory to conduct the testing and shall consider designating a
- laboratory] that is accredited by the American Society of Crime 13
- Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board <sup>1</sup>or a laboratory 14
- that has a certificate of compliance with national standards issued 15
- pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the National Forensic 16
- 17 Science Technology Center<sup>1</sup>.

4

- f. The result of any testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be 18
- 19 fully disclosed to the person filing the motion, the prosecutor and the
- 20 Attorney General. If requested by any party, the court shall order
- 21 production of the underlying laboratory data and notes.
- 22 g. The costs of the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section 23 shall be borne by the <sup>1</sup>[State] <u>convicted person</u><sup>1</sup>.
- 24 h. An order granting or denying a motion for DNA testing pursuant
- to this section may be appealed, pursuant to Rules of Court. <sup>1</sup>[Any 25
- 26 such appeal shall be filed within 20 days after the court's order
- 27 granting or denying the motion for DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup>
- 28 i. DNA testing ordered by the court pursuant to this section shall
- 29 be done as soon as practicable. <sup>1</sup>[However, if the court finds that a
- 30 miscarriage of justice will otherwise occur and that it is necessary in
- 31 the interests of justice to give priority to the DNA testing, a DNA
- 32 laboratory shall be required to give priority to the DNA testing
- 33 ordered pursuant to this section over the laboratory's other pending
- casework.]<sup>1</sup> 34

- 35 j. DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a
- convicted person pursuant to a motion for <sup>1</sup>[postconviction] post-36
- 37 conviction DNA testing [pursuant to] in accordance with the
- provisions of <sup>1</sup> this section <sup>1</sup>[is exempt from any law requiring 38
- disclosure of information to the public shall be treated as confidential 39
- and shall not be deemed a public record under P.L.1963, c.73
- 41 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) or the common law concerning access to public
- 42 records; except as provided in section 2 of P.L. c, (C. )(now
- 43 pending before the Legislature as section 2 of this bill)<sup>1</sup>.
- <sup>1</sup>k. As used in this act, the terms "DNA," "DNA sample," DNA 44
- databank," "CODIS" and "FBI" shall have the meaning set forth in 45

#### section 3 of P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.19).<sup>1</sup>

1 2

2021

22

23

24

2526

27

- 3 2. a. Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary <sup>1</sup>[and subject to subsection b. of this section] <sup>1</sup>, the Division of State 4 5 Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety shall retain <sup>1</sup>[any biological material secured in connection with a criminal case for the 6 7 period of time that the convicted person remains incarcerated in 8 connection with the case all DNA profile information from biological 9 samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to the provisions of 10 section 1 of P.L. c, (C. )(now pending before the 11 Legislature as this bill) and may use the profile information in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes. <sup>1</sup> The <sup>1</sup> [material] DNA 12 profile information<sup>1</sup> shall be <sup>1</sup>added to, <sup>1</sup> stored and maintained in the 13 State DNA databank established pursuant to the "DNA Database and 14 Databank Act of 1994," P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.17 et seq.) <sup>1</sup>and 15 shall be forwarded to the FBI for inclusion in CODIS<sup>1</sup>. <sup>1</sup>[The division 16 shall have the discretion to determine how the evidence is retained 17 pursuant to this section, provided that the evidence is retained in a 18 condition suitable for DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup> 19
  - <sup>1</sup>[b. The division may dispose of biological material before the expiration of the period of time described in subsection a. if all the conditions set forth below are met:
  - (1) The division notifies all of the following persons of the provisions of this section and of the intention of the division to dispose of the material: any person who as a result of a conviction in the case is currently serving a term of imprisonment and who remains incarcerated in connection with the case; any counsel of record; the public defender in the county of the conviction; the prosecutor in the county of the conviction and the Attorney General.
- 30 (2) The division does not receive, within 90 days of sending the notification, any of the following:
- 32 (a) A copy of the motion filed pursuant to section 1 of 33 P.L. c., (C.) (now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill), however, upon filing of that motion, the division shall 35 retain the material only until the time that the court's denial of the 36 motion is final.
- 37 (b) A sworn request that the material not be destroyed or disposed 38 of because the declarant will file within 180 days a motion for DNA 39 testing pursuant to section 1 of P.L. , (C. c. )(now pending 40 before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill) that is followed within 41 180 days by a copy of the motion for DNA testing pursuant to section 1 of P.L. 42 c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as 43 section 1 of this bill), unless a request for an extension is requested by the convicted person and agreed to by the governmental entity in 44 45 possession of the evidence.
- 46 (c) A copy of a sworn declaration of innocence that has been filed

#### **S1920** [1R] MARTIN, O'CONNOR

- with the court within 180 days of the judgment of conviction. 1 2 However, the court shall permit the destruction of the evidence upon
- 3 a showing that the declaration is false or there is no issue of identity
- 4 that would be affected by additional testing. The convicted person
- may be cross-examined on the declaration at any hearing conducted 5
- pursuant to this section or on an application by or on behalf of the 6
- convicted person pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c., (C. 7 8
- pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill). (3) No other provision of law requires that biological evidence be 9
- preserved or retained. 1<sup>1</sup> 10
- <sup>1</sup>[c]b<sup>1</sup>. The <sup>1</sup>[division] Attorney General <sup>1</sup>shall adopt rules 11 governing the procedures to be used in the analysis and storage of 12
- DNA <sup>1</sup>[samples and DNA testing results submitted pursuant] <sup>1</sup> profile 13
- information obtained in accordance with the provisions of 1 14
- )(now pending before the Legislature as this bill). 15 c. , (C. 16
- 17 3. The Supreme Court of New Jersey may adopt rules appropriate and necessary to effectuate the purpose of this act. 18
- 4. This act shall take effect on the <sup>1</sup>[120th] 180th day after 20 enactment <sup>1</sup>, but the Attorney General may take such anticipatory 21 administrative action in advance as shall be necessary for the 22
- 23 implementation of the act<sup>1</sup>.

#### ASSEMBLY JUDICIARY COMMITTEE

#### STATEMENT TO

# [First Reprint] **SENATE, No. 1920**

with committee amendments

### STATE OF NEW JERSEY

DATED: DECEMBER 13, 2001

The Assembly Judiciary Committee reports favorably and with committee amendments Senate Bill No. 1920 (1R).

This bill establishes procedures for post-conviction DNA testing. Section 1 of the bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing. The motion before the trial court which entered the judgment of conviction should do all of the following: (1) explain why the identity of the convicted person's was a significant issue in the case; (2) explain, in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based would be granted; (3) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial; (4) make a reasonable attempt to identify the evidence to be tested and the type of DNA testing sought; and (5) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing. In addition, if any previous DNA testing was conducted, the motion would also have to include the results of those tests.

If any DNA testing is ordered, the Attorney General or prosecutor may recommend a particular type of testing be conducted.

The bill provides that the court could not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines that all of the following conditions have been established: (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition to be tested; (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not be tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect; (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case; (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of identity; (5) the requested DNA testing results would raise a reasonable probability, if the results were favorable to the defendant,

that a motion for a new trial based upon the newly discovered evidence would be granted; (6) the evidence sought either has not been previously tested or it has been previously tested but the requested test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior tests results; (7) the testing employs a method which is generally accepted and (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.

In its original form, the bill provided that the DNA tests would be conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if the laboratory was unable to perform the testing, at a lab accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with certain national standards.

The committee amended the bill to provide that if the parties agree upon a mutually acceptable laboratory which is accredited by the appropriate board, then the testing would be done by that laboratory. If the parties fail to agree on a laboratory, then the testing would conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory. However, the court may direct that the evidence be given to an alternative accredited laboratory if good cause is shown.

The bill provides that the costs of the test would be borne by the convicted person.

Section 2 of the bill provides that all post-conviction DNA profile information obtained from a convicted person could be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes.

The bill gives rule-making authority to the Attorney General and the Supreme Court.

As amended this bill is identical to Assembly, No. 3996 (1R).

#### LEGISLATIVE FISCAL ESTIMATE

[First Reprint]

## SENATE, No. 1920 STATE OF NEW JERSEY 209th LEGISLATURE

DATED: JANUARY 16, 2002

#### **SUMMARY**

Synopsis: Provides for post-conviction DNA testing; allows post-conviction

DNA profile information to be used in the investigation and

prosecution of other crimes.

**Type of Impact:** General Fund expenditure

Agencies Affected: Department of Law and Public Safety, Judiciary

#### Office of Legislative Services Estimate

Fiscal Impact	<u>Year 1</u>	Year 2	Year 3
State Cost	Minimal	Minimal	Minimal

- ! The bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- ! The bill also notes that the court could not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines a number of conditions have been met.
- ! Information obtained from the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety, which is responsible for the identification, analysis and storage of the blood samples in a State databank notes that the cost of conducting a DNA analysis through a private vendor is currently \$40 per sample.
- ! The Administrative Office of the Courts (AOC) notes that the impact on the Judiciary would be the number of motions entered by defendants, and the need to examine these defendants for indigence status. The AOC also notes that since there are a number of requirements that must be met before DNA testing can be undertaken, the number of defendants who would need to be tested is likely to be small.

#### BILL DESCRIPTION

Senate Bill No. 1920 (1R) of 2000 establishes procedures for post-conviction DNA testing. The bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently



serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing. This motion should: (1) explain why the identity of the convicted person's was a significant issue in the case; (2) explain, in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based would be granted; (3) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial; (4) make a reasonable attempt to identify the evidence to be tested and the type of DNA testing sought; and (5) include a consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing. In addition, if there were any previous DNA testing conducted, the motion would also have to include the results of those tests.

The bill also notes that the court could not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines that all of the following conditions have been established: (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition to be tested; (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not be tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect; (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case; (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of identity; (5) the requested DNA testing results would raise a reasonable probability, if the results were favorable to the defendant, that a motion for a new trial based upon the newly discovered evidence would be granted; (6) the evidence sought either has not been previously tested or it has been previously tested but the requested test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior tests results; (7) the testing employs a method which is generally accepted and (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.

The bill requires that the cost of the test be borne by the convicted person.

#### **FISCAL ANALYSIS**

#### EXECUTIVE BRANCH

Information obtained from the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety, which is responsible for the identification, analysis and storage of the blood samples in a State data bank notes that the cost of conducting a DNA analysis through a private vendor is currently \$40 per sample.

The Administrative Office of the Courts notes that the impact on the Judiciary would be the number of motions entered by defendants, and the need to examine these defendants for indigence status. The AOC notes that since there are a number of requirements that must be met before DNA testing can be undertaken, the number of defendants who would need to be tested is likely to be small.

#### OFFICE OF LEGISLATIVE SERVICES

The Office of Legislative Services (OLS) concurs with the Judiciary estimate that the number of defendants to be affected by this bill would be small. Therefore the cost of

#### S1920 [1R]

3

implementation would be minimal. The OLS adds that while individuals who request DNA testing and analysis shall be liable for the cost of such procedure, since the majority of offenders incarcerated in State correctional institutions are indigent, it is unlikely that the State would recoup these costs.

Section: Judiciary

Analyst: Anne C. Raughley

Lead Fiscal Analyst

Approved: Alan R. Kooney

Legislative Budget and Finance Officer

This fiscal estimate has been prepared pursuant to P.L.1980, c.67.

# [Second Reprint] SENATE, No. 1920

# STATE OF NEW JERSEY 209th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED DECEMBER 4, 2000

Sponsored by:

Senator ROBERT J. MARTIN
District 26 (Essex, Morris and Passaic)
Senator EDWARD T. O'CONNOR, JR.
District 31 (Hudson)

#### Co-Sponsored by:

Senators Himelman, Allen, Sacco, Assemblyman Geist, Assemblywomen Buono and Greenstein

#### **SYNOPSIS**

Provides for post-conviction DNA testing; allows post-conviction DNA profile information to be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes.

#### **CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT**

As reported by the Assembly Judiciary Committee on December 13, 2001, with amendments.



(Sponsorship Updated As Of: 1/8/2002)

1 AN ACT concerning certain testing of evidence and supplementing 2 Title 2A and Title 53 of the New Jersey Statutes.

3

4 **BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

6 7

8

9

10

13 14

15

16

17 18

19

20

30

31

- 1. a. Any person who was convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make a motion before the trial court that entered the judgment of conviction for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- 11 (1) The motion shall be verified by the convicted person under 12 penalty of perjury and shall do all of the following:
  - (a) explain why the identity of the defendant was <sup>1</sup>[or should have been] <sup>1</sup> a significant issue in the case;
  - (b) explain in light of all the evidence, how <sup>1</sup>if the results of <sup>1</sup> the requested DNA testing <sup>1</sup>[would raise a reasonable probability that the convicted person's verdict or sentence would be more] are <sup>1</sup> favorable <sup>1</sup>[if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the time of conviction; and] to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted; <sup>1</sup>
- (c) <sup>1</sup>explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, 21 whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for 22 23 DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility 24 of DNA testing evidence at trial. If evidence was subjected to DNA 25 or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the prosecution or defense to provide 26 27 all parties and the court with access to the laboratory reports, 28 underlying data and laboratory notes prepared in connection with the 29 DNA testing; <sup>1</sup>
  - (d) make every reasonable attempt to identify both the evidence that should be tested and the specific type of DNA testing sought <sup>1</sup>:and
- (e) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA
   testing<sup>1</sup>.
- 34 (2) Notice of the motion shall be served on the Attorney General, 35 the prosecutor in the county of conviction, and if known, the 36 governmental agency or laboratory holding the evidence sought to be 37 tested. Responses, if any, shall be filed within 60 days of the date on 38 which the Attorney General <sup>1</sup>[or] and <sup>1</sup> the prosecutor are served with 39 the motion, unless a continuance is granted. <sup>1</sup>The Attorney General or 40 prosecutor may support the motion for DNA testing or oppose it with

EXPLANATION - Matter enclosed in bold-faced brackets [thus] in the above bill is not enacted and intended to be omitted in the law.

Matter underlined thus is new matter.

Matter enclosed in superscript numerals has been adopted as follows:

<sup>1</sup> Senate SJU committee amendments adopted June 28, 2001.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 2}$  Assembly AJU committee amendments adopted December 13, 2001.

- a statement of reasons and may recommend to the court that if any
   DNA testing is ordered, a particular type of testing be conducted.<sup>1</sup>
- <sup>1</sup>[(3) If any DNA or other biological evidence testing was 3 4 conducted previously by either the prosecution or defense, the results 5 of that testing shall be revealed in the motion for testing, if known. If evidence was subjected to DNA or other forensic testing previously by 6 7 either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the 8 prosecution or defense to provide all parties and the court with access 9 to the laboratory reports, underlying data, and laboratory notes 10 prepared in connection with the DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup>
  - b. The court, in its discretion, may order a hearing on the motion. The motion shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial unless the presiding judge determines that judge is unavailable. Upon request of either party, the court may order, in the interest of justice, that the convicted person be present at the hearing of the motion.

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

21

2223

24

25

26

27

33

34

35

3637

38

39

40

- c. The court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person who brings a motion pursuant this section if that person is indigent.
- d. The court shall <sup>1</sup>not<sup>1</sup> grant the motion for DNA testing

  <sup>1</sup>[if]unless, after conducting a hearing, <sup>1</sup> it determines <sup>1</sup>that <sup>1</sup> all of the

  following have been established:
  - (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition that would permit the DNA testing that is requested in the motion  ${}^{1}$ [.]:
  - (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish it has not been substituted, tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect  ${}^{1}[.]$ :
  - (3) the identity of the defendant was <sup>1</sup>[or should have been] <sup>1</sup> a significant issue <sup>1</sup>[int he] in the <sup>1</sup> case <sup>1</sup>[.]; <sup>1</sup>
- 28 (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the 29 evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of the convicted 30 person's identity as the offender <sup>1</sup>[of or accomplice to the crime, 31 special circumstance, or enhancement allegation that resulted in the 32 conviction or sentence.]:<sup>1</sup>
  - (5) the requested DNA testing result would raise a reasonable probability that <sup>1</sup>[, in light of all the evidence, the convicted person's verdict or sentence would have been more] if the results were <sup>1</sup> favorable <sup>1</sup>[ if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the time of conviction] to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted <sup>1</sup>. The court in its discretion may consider any evidence whether or not it was introduced at trial <sup>1</sup>[.]:<sup>1</sup>
- 41 (6) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> evidence sought to be tested meets either of the following conditions:
  - (a) it was not tested previously;
- 44 (b) it was tested previously, but the requested DNA test would 45 provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative

- of the identity of the offender <sup>1</sup>[or accomplice] <sup>1</sup> or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior test results <sup>1</sup>[.]; <sup>1</sup>
  - (7) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> testing requested employs a method generally accepted within the relevant scientific community <sup>1</sup>[.]; and <sup>1</sup>
    - (8) <sup>1</sup>[The] the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- e. If the court grants the motion for DNA testing, the court order shall identify the specific evidence to be tested and the DNA
- 8 technology to be used. <sup>2</sup>[The testing shall be conducted <sup>1</sup>by the New
- 9 Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if that laboratory
- is unable to perform the testing, at 1 a laboratory 1 [mutually agreed]
- upon by the prosecutor, the Attorney General and the person filing the
- motion. If the parties cannot agree, the court's order shall designate
- 13 the laboratory to conduct the testing and shall consider designating a
- laboratory] that is 1 (1) If the parties agree upon a mutually
- 15 acceptable laboratory that is<sup>2</sup> accredited by the American Society of
- 16 Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board <sup>1</sup>or a
- 10 Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board of a
- laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with national standards
   issued pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the National
- 19 Forensic Science Technology Center<sup>1</sup> <sup>2</sup>, the testing shall be
- 20 conducted by that laboratory<sup>2</sup>.

3

4

- 21 <sup>2</sup>(2) If the parties fail to agree, the testing shall be conducted by the
- 22 New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory. For good cause
- 23 shown, however, the court may direct the evidence to an alternative
- 24 <u>laboratory that is accredited by the American Society of Crime</u>
- 25 <u>Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board or a laboratory</u>
- 26 that has a certificate of compliance with national standards issued
- 27 pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the National Forensic
- 28 <u>Science Technology Center.</u><sup>2</sup>
- 29 f. The result of any testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be
- 30 fully disclosed to the person filing the motion, the prosecutor and the
- 31 Attorney General. If requested by any party, the court shall order
- 32 production of the underlying laboratory data and notes.
- g. The costs of the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section
- shall be borne by the <sup>1</sup>[State] convicted person<sup>1</sup>.
- h. An order granting or denying a motion for DNA testing pursuant
- 36 to this section may be appealed, pursuant to Rules of Court. <sup>1</sup>[Any
- 37 such appeal shall be filed within 20 days after the court's order
- 38 granting or denying the motion for DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup>
- i. DNA testing ordered by the court pursuant to this section shall
- 40 be done as soon as practicable. <sup>1</sup>[However, if the court finds that a
- 41 miscarriage of justice will otherwise occur and that it is necessary in
- 42 the interests of justice to give priority to the DNA testing, a DNA
- 43 laboratory shall be required to give priority to the DNA testing

1 ordered pursuant to this section over the laboratory's other pending 2 casework.]<sup>1</sup>

3 j. DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a 4 convicted person pursuant to a motion for <sup>1</sup>[postconviction] post-5 conviction DNA testing pursuant to in accordance with the provisions of 1 this section 1 [is exempt from any law requiring 6 7 disclosure of information to the public shall be treated as confidential 8 and shall not be deemed a public record under P.L.1963, c.73 9 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) or the common law concerning access to public 10 records; except as provided in section 2 of P.L. c, (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 2 of this bill)<sup>1</sup>. 11 <sup>1</sup>k. As used in this act, the terms "DNA," "DNA sample," DNA 12 13

databank," "CODIS" and "FBI" shall have the meaning set forth in section 3 of P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.19).<sup>1</sup>

14 15

33 34

35 36

37

38

39

40

41

- 16 2. a. Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary <sup>1</sup>[and subject to subsection b. of this section] <sup>1</sup>, the Division of State 17 Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety shall retain <sup>1</sup> [any 18 19 biological material secured in connection with a criminal case for the 20 period of time that the convicted person remains incarcerated in connection with the case all DNA profile information from biological 21 22 samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to the provisions of section 1 of P.L. c, (C. )(now pending before the 23 Legislature as this bill) and may use the profile information in the 24 investigation and prosecution of other crimes. <sup>1</sup> The <sup>1</sup> [material] DNA 25 profile information<sup>1</sup> shall be <sup>1</sup>added to, <sup>1</sup> stored and maintained in the 26 27 State DNA databank established pursuant to the "DNA Database and Databank Act of 1994," P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.17 et seq.) <sup>1</sup>and 28 shall be forwarded to the FBI for inclusion in CODIS<sup>1</sup>. <sup>1</sup>[The division 29 30 shall have the discretion to determine how the evidence is retained 31 pursuant to this section, provided that the evidence is retained in a condition suitable for DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup> 32
  - <sup>1</sup>[b. The division may dispose of biological material before the expiration of the period of time described in subsection a. if all the conditions set forth below are met:
  - (1) The division notifies all of the following persons of the provisions of this section and of the intention of the division to dispose of the material: any person who as a result of a conviction in the case is currently serving a term of imprisonment and who remains incarcerated in connection with the case; any counsel of record; the public defender in the county of the conviction; the prosecutor in the county of the conviction and the Attorney General.
- 43 (2) The division does not receive, within 90 days of sending the 44 notification, any of the following:

#### **S1920** [2R] MARTIN, O'CONNOR

6

- 1 (a) A copy of the motion filed pursuant to section 1 of 2 P.L. c., (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill), however, upon filing of that motion, the division shall retain the material only until the time that the court's denial of the motion is final.
- 6 (b) A sworn request that the material not be destroyed or disposed 7 of because the declarant will file within 180 days a motion for DNA 8 testing pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending 9 before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill) that is followed within 180 days by a copy of the motion for DNA testing pursuant to section 10 11 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as 12 section 1 of this bill), unless a request for an extension is requested by 13 the convicted person and agreed to by the governmental entity in 14 possession of the evidence.
- 15 (c) A copy of a sworn declaration of innocence that has been filed with the court within 180 days of the judgment of conviction. 16 17 However, the court shall permit the destruction of the evidence upon 18 a showing that the declaration is false or there is no issue of identity 19 that would be affected by additional testing. The convicted person 20 may be cross-examined on the declaration at any hearing conducted 21 pursuant to this section or on an application by or on behalf of the 22 convicted person pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c. , (C. 23 pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill).
  - (3) No other provision of law requires that biological evidence be preserved or retained.]<sup>1</sup>
- <sup>1</sup>[c]b<sup>1</sup>. The <sup>1</sup>[division] Attorney General<sup>1</sup> shall adopt rules governing the procedures to be used in the analysis and storage of DNA <sup>1</sup>[samples and DNA testing results submitted pursuant] <sup>1</sup> profile information obtained in accordance with the provisions of <sup>1</sup>

  P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as this bill).

31

24

25

32 3. The Supreme Court of New Jersey may adopt rules appropriate 33 and necessary to effectuate the purpose of this act.

34

4. This act shall take effect on the <sup>1</sup>[120th] 180th <sup>1</sup> day after enactment <sup>1</sup>, but the Attorney General may take such anticipatory administrative action in advance as shall be necessary for the implementation of the act <sup>1</sup>.

## ASSEMBLY, No. 3996

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY

### 209th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED DECEMBER 6, 2001

Sponsored by:

Assemblyman GEORGE F. GEIST District 4 (Camden and Gloucester) Assemblywoman BARBARA BUONO District 18 (Middlesex)

#### **SYNOPSIS**

Provides for post-conviction DNA testing; allows post-conviction DNA profile information to be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes.

#### **CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT**

As introduced.



(Sponsorship Updated As Of: 12/14/2001)

1 AN ACT concerning certain testing of evidence and supplementing 2 Title 2A and Title 53 of the New Jersey Statutes.

**BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

- 1. a. Any person who was convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make a motion before the trial court that entered the judgment of conviction for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- 11 (1) The motion shall be verified by the convicted person under 12 penalty of perjury and shall do all of the following:
  - (a) explain why the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case;
  - (b) explain in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted;
  - (c) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial. If evidence was subjected to DNA or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the prosecution or defense to provide all parties and the court with access to the laboratory reports, underlying data and laboratory notes prepared in connection with the DNA testing;
  - (d) make every reasonable attempt to identify both the evidence that should be tested and the specific type of DNA testing sought; and
    - (e) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing.
  - (2) Notice of the motion shall be served on the Attorney General, the prosecutor in the county of conviction, and if known, the governmental agency or laboratory holding the evidence sought to be tested. Responses, if any, shall be filed within 60 days of the date on which the Attorney General and the prosecutor are served with the motion, unless a continuance is granted. The Attorney General or prosecutor may support the motion for DNA testing or oppose it with a statement of reasons and may recommend to the court that if any DNA testing is ordered, a particular type of testing be conducted.
  - b. The court, in its discretion, may order a hearing on the motion. The motion shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial unless the presiding judge determines that judge is unavailable. Upon request of either party, the court may order, in the interest of justice, that the convicted person be present at the hearing of the motion.
  - c. The court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person who brings a motion pursuant this section if that person is indigent.
    - d. The court shall not grant the motion for DNA testing unless,

- 1 after conducting a hearing, it determines that all of the following have 2 been established:
  - (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition that would permit the DNA testing that is requested in the motion;
- (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody 6 sufficient to establish it has not been substituted, tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect;
  - (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case;
  - (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of the convicted person's identity as the offender;
  - (5) the requested DNA testing result would raise a reasonable probability that if the results were favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted. The court in its discretion may consider any evidence whether or not it was introduced at trial;
- 17 (6) the evidence sought to be tested meets either of the following 18 conditions:
  - (a) it was not tested previously;

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33 34

35

36 37

38

- (b) it was tested previously, but the requested DNA test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior test results;
- (7) the testing requested employs a method generally accepted within the relevant scientific community; and
  - (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- e. If the court grants the motion for DNA testing, the court order shall identify the specific evidence to be tested and the DNA technology to be used. The testing shall be conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if that laboratory is unable to perform the testing, at a laboratory that is accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with national standards issued pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the National Forensic Science Technology Center.
  - f. The result of any testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be fully disclosed to the person filing the motion, the prosecutor and the Attorney General. If requested by any party, the court shall order production of the underlying laboratory data and notes.
- 40 g. The costs of the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section 41 shall be borne by the convicted person.
- 42 h. An order granting or denying a motion for DNA testing pursuant 43 to this section may be appealed, pursuant to Rules of Court.
- 44 i. DNA testing ordered by the court pursuant to this section shall 45 be done as soon as practicable.
- j. DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a 46

#### A3996 GEIST, BUONO

- 1 convicted person pursuant to a motion for post-conviction DNA 2 testing in accordance with the provisions of this section shall be 3 treated as confidential and shall not be deemed a public record under 4 P.L.1963, c.73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) or the common law concerning access to public records; except as provided in section 2 of P.L., c. 5 6 (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 2 of this bill). k. As used in this act, the terms "DNA," "DNA sample," DNA 7 8 databank," "CODIS" and "FBI" shall have the meaning set forth in 9 section 3 of P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.19). 10 2. a. Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, 11 the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public 12 13 Safety shall retain all DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to the provisions of section 1 14 15 (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as this bill) and may use the profile information in the investigation and 16 17 prosecution of other crimes. The DNA profile information shall be added to, stored and maintained in the State DNA databank 18 established pursuant to the "DNA Database and Databank Act of 19 20 1994," P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.17 et seq.) and shall be forwarded 21 to the FBI for inclusion in CODIS. 22 b. The Attorney General shall adopt rules governing the procedures 23
  - to be used in the analysis and storage of DNA profile information obtained in accordance with the provisions P.L., c. (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as this bill).

3. The Supreme Court of New Jersey may adopt rules appropriate and necessary to effectuate the purpose of this act.

4. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after enactment, but the Attorney General may take such anticipatory administrative action in advance as shall be necessary for the implementation of the act.

33 34 35

24

25

26 27

28

29 30

31

32

#### **STATEMENT**

36 37

38

39

40

41

42

43 44

45

46

This bill establishes procedures for post-conviction DNA testing. Section 1 of the bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing. The motion should do all of the following: (1) explain why the identity of the convicted person's was a significant issue in the case; (2) explain, in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based would be granted; (3) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to

1 providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the

- 2 defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at
- 3 trial; (4) make a reasonable attempt to identify the evidence to be
- 4 tested and the type of DNA testing sought; and (5) include a consent
- 5 to provide a biological sample for DNA testing. In addition, if there
- 6 were any previous DNA testing conducted, the motion would also
- 7 have to include the results of those tests.

8 In addition, the bill provides that, if any DNA testing is ordered, the

9 Attorney General or prosecutor may recommend a particular type of

10 testing be conducted.

30

31

32

33

34

3536

37

38

39

40

11 Further, the bill provides that the court could not grant the motion 12 for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines that 13 all of the following conditions have been established: (1) the evidence 14 to be tested is available and in a condition to be tested; (2) the 15 evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not be tampered with, replaced or altered in any 16 17 material aspect; (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant 18 issue in the case; (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie 19 showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue 20 of identity; (5) the requested DNA testing results would raise a 21 reasonable probability, if the results were favorable to the defendant, 22 that a motion for a new trial based upon the newly discovered 23 evidence would be granted; (6) the evidence sought either has not been previously tested or it has been previously tested but the requested test 24 25 would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and 26 probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable 27 probability of contradicting prior tests results; (7) the testing employs 28 a method which is generally accepted and (8) the motion is not made 29 solely for the purpose of delay.

The bill also provides that the DNA tests would be conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if the laboratory was unable to perform the testing at a lab that was accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance. The costs of the test would be borne by the convicted person.

Under the bill, all post-conviction DNA profile information obtained from a convicted person could be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes. The bill gives the rule-making authority to the Attorney General.

#### ASSEMBLY JUDICIARY COMMITTEE

#### STATEMENT TO

#### ASSEMBLY, No. 3996

with committee amendments

### STATE OF NEW JERSEY

DATED: DECEMBER 13, 2001

The Assembly Judiciary Committee reports favorably and with committee amendments Assembly Bill No. 3996.

This bill establishes procedures for post-conviction DNA testing. Section 1 of the bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing. The motion before the trial court which entered the judgment of conviction should do all of the following: (1) explain why the identity of the convicted person's was a significant issue in the case; (2) explain, in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based would be granted; (3) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial; (4) make a reasonable attempt to identify the evidence to be tested and the type of DNA testing sought; and (5) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing. In addition, if any previous DNA testing was conducted, the motion would also have to include the results of those tests.

If any DNA testing is ordered, the Attorney General or prosecutor may recommend a particular type of testing be conducted.

The bill provides that the court could not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines that all of the following conditions have been established: (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition to be tested; (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not be tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect; (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case; (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of identity; (5) the requested DNA testing results would raise a reasonable probability, if the results were favorable to the defendant, that a motion for a new trial based upon the newly discovered evidence would be granted; (6) the evidence sought either has not

been previously tested or it has been previously tested but the requested test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior tests results; (7) the testing employs a method which is generally accepted and (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.

In its original form, the bill provided that the DNA tests would be conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if the laboratory was unable to perform the testing, at a lab accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with certain national standards.

The committee amended the bill to provide that if the parties agree upon a mutually acceptable laboratory which is accredited by the appropriate board, then the testing would be done by that laboratory. If the parties fail to agree on a laboratory, then the testing would conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory. However, the court may direct that the evidence be given to an alternative accredited laboratory if good cause is shown.

The bill provides that the costs of the test would be borne by the convicted person.

Section 2 of the bill provides that all post-conviction DNA profile information obtained from a convicted person could be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes.

The bill gives rule-making authority to the Attorney General and the Supreme Court.

As amended this bill is identical to Senate, No. 1920 (2R).

# [First Reprint] ASSEMBLY, No. 3996

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY 209th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED DECEMBER 6, 2001

Sponsored by:

Assemblyman GEORGE F. GEIST District 4 (Camden and Gloucester) Assemblywoman BARBARA BUONO District 18 (Middlesex)

Co-Sponsored by:

**Assemblywoman Greenstein** 

#### **SYNOPSIS**

Provides for post-conviction DNA testing; allows post-conviction DNA profile information to be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes.

#### **CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT**

As reported by the Assembly Judiciary Committee on December 13, 2001, with amendments.



(Sponsorship Updated As Of: 1/4/2002)

1 AN ACT concerning certain testing of evidence and supplementing 2 Title 2A and Title 53 of the New Jersey Statutes.

**BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

- 1. a. Any person who was convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make a motion before the trial court that entered the judgment of conviction for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- 11 (1) The motion shall be verified by the convicted person under 12 penalty of perjury and shall do all of the following:
  - (a) explain why the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case;
  - (b) explain in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted;
  - (c) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial. If evidence was subjected to DNA or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the prosecution or defense to provide all parties and the court with access to the laboratory reports, underlying data and laboratory notes prepared in connection with the DNA testing;
    - (d) make every reasonable attempt to identify both the evidence that should be tested and the specific type of DNA testing sought; and
      - (e) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing.
    - (2) Notice of the motion shall be served on the Attorney General, the prosecutor in the county of conviction, and if known, the governmental agency or laboratory holding the evidence sought to be tested. Responses, if any, shall be filed within 60 days of the date on which the Attorney General and the prosecutor are served with the motion, unless a continuance is granted. The Attorney General or prosecutor may support the motion for DNA testing or oppose it with a statement of reasons and may recommend to the court that if any DNA testing is ordered, a particular type of testing be conducted.
- b. The court, in its discretion, may order a hearing on the motion.
  The motion shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial unless
  the presiding judge determines that judge is unavailable. Upon request
  of either party, the court may order, in the interest of justice, that the

EXPLANATION - Matter enclosed in bold-faced brackets [thus] in the above bill is not enacted and intended to be omitted in the law.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Assembly AJU committee amendments adopted December 13, 2001.

1 convicted person be present at the hearing of the motion.

2

3

9

10

11

13

14

15

16 17

18 19

20

23

2425

26

27

28 29

- c. The court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person who brings a motion pursuant this section if that person is indigent.
- d. The court shall not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines that all of the following have been established:
- 7 (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition that 8 would permit the DNA testing that is requested in the motion;
  - (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish it has not been substituted, tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect;
- 12 (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case;
  - (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of the convicted person's identity as the offender;
  - (5) the requested DNA testing result would raise a reasonable probability that if the results were favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted. The court in its discretion may consider any evidence whether or not it was introduced at trial;
- 21 (6) the evidence sought to be tested meets either of the following 22 conditions:
  - (a) it was not tested previously;
  - (b) it was tested previously, but the requested DNA test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior test results;
  - (7) the testing requested employs a method generally accepted within the relevant scientific community; and
    - (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- 31 e. If the court grants the motion for DNA testing, the court order 32 shall identify the specific evidence to be tested and the DNA technology to be used. <sup>1</sup>[The testing shall be conducted by the New 33 34 Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if that laboratory 35 is unable to perform the testing, at a (1) If the parties agree upon a mutually acceptable<sup>1</sup> laboratory that is accredited by the American 36 37 Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with national 38 standards issued pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the 39 National Forensic Science Technology Center <sup>1</sup>, the testing shall be 40 conducted by that laboratory<sup>1</sup>. 41
- 1(2) If the parties fail to agree, the testing shall be conducted by the
  New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory. For good cause
  shown, however, the court may direct the evidence to an alternative
  laboratory that is accredited by the American Society of Crime
  Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board or a laboratory

#### **A3996** [1R] GEIST, BUONO

4

- 1 that has a certificate of compliance with national standards issued
- 2 pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the National Forensic
- 3 Science Technology Center.<sup>1</sup>
- 4 f. The result of any testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be
- 5 fully disclosed to the person filing the motion, the prosecutor and the
- 6 Attorney General. If requested by any party, the court shall order
- 7 production of the underlying laboratory data and notes.
- g. The costs of the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this sectionshall be borne by the convicted person.
- h. An order granting or denying a motion for DNA testing pursuant to this section may be appealed, pursuant to Rules of Court.
- i. DNA testing ordered by the court pursuant to this section shallbe done as soon as practicable.
- j. DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a
- 15 convicted person pursuant to a motion for post-conviction DNA
- 16 testing in accordance with the provisions of this section shall be
- 17 treated as confidential and shall not be deemed a public record under
- 18 P.L.1963, c.73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) or the common law concerning
- 19 access to public records; except as provided in section 2 of
- 20 P.L., c. (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 2 of
- 21 this bill).
- 22 k. As used in this act, the terms "DNA," "DNA sample," DNA
- 23 databank," "CODIS" and "FBI" shall have the meaning set forth in
- 24 section 3 of P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.19).

25

- 26 2. a. Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary,
- 27 the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public
- 28 Safety shall retain all DNA profile information from biological samples
- 29 taken from a convicted person pursuant to the provisions of section 1
- 30 of P.L., c. (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as this
- 31 bill) and may use the profile information in the investigation and
- prosecution of other crimes. The DNA profile information shall be added to, stored and maintained in the State DNA databank
- established pursuant to the "DNA Database and Databank Act of
- 25 1004 || D.I. 1004 || 126 (C. 52 1 20 17 4 || ) || 1 1 11 1 || 6 || 1 1
- 35 1994," P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.17 et seq.) and shall be forwarded
- 36 to the FBI for inclusion in CODIS.
- b. The Attorney General shall adopt rules governing the procedures
- 38 to be used in the analysis and storage of DNA profile information
- 39 obtained in accordance with the provisions of
- 40 P.L., c. (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as this bill).

41

3. The Supreme Court of New Jersey may adopt rules appropriate and necessary to effectuate the purpose of this act.

- 4. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after enactment, but
- 46 the Attorney General may take such anticipatory administrative action
- 47 in advance as shall be necessary for the implementation of the act.

#### LEGISLATIVE FISCAL ESTIMATE

[First Reprint]

## ASSEMBLY, No. 3996 STATE OF NEW JERSEY 209th LEGISLATURE

DATED: JANUARY 18, 2002

#### **SUMMARY**

Synopsis: Provides for post-conviction DNA testing; allows post-conviction

DNA profile information to be used in the investigation and

prosecution of other crimes.

**Type of Impact:** General Fund expenditure

Agencies Affected: Department of Law and Public Safety, Judiciary

#### Office of Legislative Services Estimate

Fiscal Impact	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
State Cost	Minimal	Minimal	Minimal

- ! The Office of Legislative Services (OLS) **concurs** with the Executive estimate and the number of defendants to be affected by this bill would be small. Therefore the cost of implementation would be minimal.
- ! The bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- ! The bill also notes that the court could not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines a number of conditions have been met.
- ! Information obtained from the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety, which is responsible for the identification, analysis and storage of the blood samples in a State databank notes that the cost of conducting a DNA analysis through a private vendor is currently \$40 per sample.
- ! The Administrative Office of the Courts notes that the impact on the Judiciary would be the number of motions entered by defendants, and the need to examine these defendants for indigency status. The AOC also notes that since there are a number of requirements that must be met before DNA testing can be undertaken, the number of defendants who would need to be tested is likely to be small.



#### **BILL DESCRIPTION**

Assembly Bill No. 3996 (1R) of 2001 establishes procedures for post-conviction DNA testing. The bill provides that any person who has been convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make an application to the court for the performance of forensic DNA testing. This motion should: (1) explain why the identity of the convicted person's was a significant issue in the case; (2) explain, in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based would be granted; (3) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial; (4) make a reasonable attempt to identify the evidence to be tested and the type of DNA testing sought; and (5) include a consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing. In addition, if there were any previous DNA testing conducted, the motion would also have to include the results of those tests.

The bill also notes that the court could not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing, it determines that all of the following conditions have been established: (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition to be tested; (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not be tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect; (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case; (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of identity; (5) the requested DNA testing results would raise a reasonable probability, if the results were favorable to the defendant, that a motion for a new trial based upon the newly discovered evidence would be granted; (6) the evidence sought either has not been previously tested or it has been previously tested but the requested test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior tests results; (7) the testing employs a method which is generally accepted and (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.

The bill requires that the cost of the test be borne by the convicted person.

#### FISCAL ANALYSIS

#### **EXECUTIVE BRANCH**

Information obtained from the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety, which is responsible for the identification, analysis and storage of the blood samples in a State data bank notes that the cost of conducting a DNA analysis through a private vendor is currently \$40 per sample.

The Administrative Office of the Courts notes that the impact on the Judiciary would be the number of motions entered by defendants, and the need to examine these defendants for indigency status. The AOC notes that since there are a number of requirements that must be met before DNA testing can be undertaken, the number of defendants who would need to be tested is likely to be small.

#### OFFICE OF LEGISLATIVE SERVICES

The Office of Legislative Services (OLS) concurs with the Executive estimate and the number of defendants to be affected by this bill would be small. Therefore the cost of implementation would be minimal. The OLS adds that while individuals who request DNA testing and analysis shall be liable for the cost of such procedure, since the majority of offenders incarcerated in State correctional institutions are indigent, it is unlikely that the State would recoup these costs.

Section: Judiciary

Analyst: Anne C. Raughley

Lead Fiscal Analyst

Approved: Alan R. Kooney

Legislative Budget and Finance Officer

This legislative fiscal estimate has been produced by the Office of Legislative Services due to the failure of the Executive Branch to respond to our request for a fiscal note.

This fiscal estimate has been prepared pursuant to P.L.1980, c.67.

§1,3 -C.2A:84A-32a & 2A:84A-32b §2 - C.53:1-20.37 §4 - Note to §§1-3

#### P.L. 2001, CHAPTER 377, approved January 8, 2002 Senate, No. 1920 (Second Reprint)

1 AN ACT concerning certain testing of evidence and supplementing 2 Title 2A and Title 53 of the New Jersey Statutes.

3

**BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

5

- 1. a. Any person who was convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make a motion before the trial court that entered the judgment of conviction for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- (1) The motion shall be verified by the convicted person under penalty of perjury and shall do all of the following:
  - (a) explain why the identity of the defendant was <sup>1</sup>[or should have been]<sup>1</sup> a significant issue in the case;
- (b) explain in light of all the evidence, how <sup>1</sup>if the results of <sup>1</sup> the requested DNA testing <sup>1</sup>[would raise a reasonable probability that the convicted person's verdict or sentence would be more] are <sup>1</sup> favorable <sup>1</sup>[if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the time of conviction; and] to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted; <sup>1</sup>
- (c) <sup>1</sup>explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, 21 22 whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for 23 DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial. If evidence was subjected to DNA 24 25 or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the prosecution or defense to provide 26 all parties and the court with access to the laboratory reports, 27 underlying data and laboratory notes prepared in connection with the 28 DNA testing; <sup>1</sup> 29
- (d) make every reasonable attempt to identify both the evidence that should be tested and the specific type of DNA testing sought 1:and
- (e) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA
   testing<sup>1</sup>.
- 34 (2) Notice of the motion shall be served on the Attorney General, 35 the prosecutor in the county of conviction, and if known, the 36 governmental agency or laboratory holding the evidence sought to be

EXPLANATION - Matter enclosed in bold-faced brackets [thus] in the above bill is not enacted and intended to be omitted in the law.

Matter underlined thus is new matter.

Matter enclosed in superscript numerals has been adopted as follows:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Senate SJU committee amendments adopted June 28, 2001.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 2}$  Assembly AJU committee amendments adopted December 13, 2001.

- tested. Responses, if any, shall be filed within 60 days of the date on 1
- 2 which the Attorney General <sup>1</sup>[or] and <sup>1</sup> the prosecutor are served with
- the motion, unless a continuance is granted. <sup>1</sup>The Attorney General or 3
- 4 prosecutor may support the motion for DNA testing or oppose it with
- 5 a statement of reasons and may recommend to the court that if any
- DNA testing is ordered, a particular type of testing be conducted.<sup>1</sup> 6
- 7 <sup>1</sup>[(3) If any DNA or other biological evidence testing was conducted previously by either the prosecution or defense, the results 8 9 of that testing shall be revealed in the motion for testing, if known. If 10 evidence was subjected to DNA or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the 11 12 prosecution or defense to provide all parties and the court with access 13 to the laboratory reports, underlying data, and laboratory notes
- b. The court, in its discretion, may order a hearing on the motion. 15 The motion shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial unless 16

prepared in connection with the DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup>

14

27 28

29

32 33

34

35

- 17 the presiding judge determines that judge is unavailable. Upon request of either party, the court may order, in the interest of justice, that the 18 19
  - convicted person be present at the hearing of the motion.
- 20 c. The court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person who 21 brings a motion pursuant this section if that person is indigent.
- The court shall <sup>1</sup>not <sup>1</sup> grant the motion for DNA testing 22 <sup>1</sup>[if]unless, after conducting a hearing, <sup>1</sup> it determines <sup>1</sup>that <sup>1</sup> all of the 23 following have been established: 24
- (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition that 25 would permit the DNA testing that is requested in the motion <sup>1</sup>[.]:<sup>1</sup> 26
  - (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish it has not been substituted, tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect <sup>1</sup>[.]:
- (3) the identity of the defendant was <sup>1</sup>[or should have been] <sup>1</sup> a 30 significant issue <sup>1</sup>[int he] in the <sup>1</sup> case <sup>1</sup>[.]; <sup>1</sup> 31
  - (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of the convicted person's identity as the offender <sup>1</sup>[of or accomplice to the crime, special circumstance, or enhancement allegation that resulted in the conviction or sentence.]:
- 37 (5) the requested DNA testing result would raise a reasonable probability that <sup>1</sup>[, in light of all the evidence, the convicted person's 38 verdict or sentence would have been more] if the results were<sup>1</sup> 39 favorable <sup>1</sup>[ if the results of the DNA testing had been available at the 40 time of conviction] to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based 41 upon newly discovered evidence would be granted<sup>1</sup>. The court in its 42 43 discretion may consider any evidence whether or not it was introduced 44 at trial <sup>1</sup>[.]:<sup>1</sup>
- (6) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> evidence sought to be tested meets either of the 45

3

1 following conditions:

2

- (a) it was not tested previously;
- 3 (b) it was tested previously, but the requested DNA test would 4 provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative 5 of the identity of the offender <sup>1</sup>[or accomplice] <sup>1</sup> or have a reasonable
- 6 probability of contradicting prior test results <sup>1</sup>[.]: <sup>1</sup>
- 7 (7) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> testing requested employs a method generally accepted within the relevant scientific community <sup>1</sup>[.]; and <sup>1</sup>
  - (8) <sup>1</sup>[The] the <sup>1</sup> motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- e. If the court grants the motion for DNA testing, the court order shall identify the specific evidence to be tested and the DNA
- 12 technology to be used. <sup>2</sup>[The testing shall be conducted <sup>1</sup>by the New
- 13 Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory or, if that laboratory
- 14 <u>is unable to perform the testing, at</u><sup>1</sup> a laboratory <sup>1</sup> [mutually agreed
- upon by the prosecutor, the Attorney General and the person filing the
- motion. If the parties cannot agree, the court's order shall designate
- 17 the laboratory to conduct the testing and shall consider designating a
- 18 laboratory] that is 1 (1) If the parties agree upon a mutually
- 19 <u>acceptable laboratory that is</u><sup>2</sup> accredited by the American Society of
- 20 Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board <sup>1</sup>or a
- 21 <u>laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with national standards</u>
- 22 issued pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the National
- Forensic Science Technology Center<sup>1</sup> <sup>2</sup>, the testing shall be conducted by that laboratory<sup>2</sup>.
- 25 <sup>2</sup>(2) If the parties fail to agree, the testing shall be conducted by the
- 26 New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory. For good cause
- 27 shown, however, the court may direct the evidence to an alternative
- 28 laboratory that is accredited by the American Society of Crime
- 29 <u>Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board or a laboratory</u>
- 30 that has a certificate of compliance with national standards issued
- 31 pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. section 14131 from the National Forensic
- 32 <u>Science Technology Center.</u><sup>2</sup>
- f. The result of any testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be
- 34 fully disclosed to the person filing the motion, the prosecutor and the
- 35 Attorney General. If requested by any party, the court shall order
- 36 production of the underlying laboratory data and notes.
- g. The costs of the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section
- shall be borne by the <sup>1</sup>[State] <u>convicted person</u><sup>1</sup>.
- h. An order granting or denying a motion for DNA testing pursuant
- 40 to this section may be appealed, pursuant to Rules of Court. <sup>1</sup>[Any
- 41 such appeal shall be filed within 20 days after the court's order
- 42 granting or denying the motion for DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup>
- i. DNA testing ordered by the court pursuant to this section shall
- 44 be done as soon as practicable. <sup>1</sup>[However, if the court finds that a
- 45 miscarriage of justice will otherwise occur and that it is necessary in

4

the interests of justice to give priority to the DNA testing, a DNA laboratory shall be required to give priority to the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section over the laboratory's other pending casework.]<sup>1</sup>

5 j. DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to a motion for <sup>1</sup>[postconviction] post-6 conviction DNA testing pursuant to in accordance with the 7 8 provisions of 1 this section 1 [is exempt from any law requiring 9 disclosure of information to the public shall be treated as confidential 10 and shall not be deemed a public record under P.L.1963, c.73 11 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) or the common law concerning access to public 12 records; except as provided in section 2 of P.L. c, (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 2 of this bill)<sup>1</sup>. 13 <sup>1</sup>k. As used in this act, the terms "DNA," "DNA sample," DNA 14 15 databank," "CODIS" and "FBI" shall have the meaning set forth in 16 section 3 of P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.19).

17

35

36

37

18 2. a. Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary <sup>1</sup>[and subject to subsection b. of this section]<sup>1</sup>, the Division of State 19 Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety shall retain <sup>1</sup>[any 20 21 biological material secured in connection with a criminal case for the 22 period of time that the convicted person remains incarcerated in 23 connection with the case all DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to the provisions of 24 section 1 of P.L. c, (C. )(now pending before the 25 Legislature as this bill) and may use the profile information in the 26 investigation and prosecution of other crimes. <sup>1</sup> The <sup>1</sup> [material] <u>DNA</u> 27 profile information<sup>1</sup> shall be <sup>1</sup>added to, <sup>1</sup> stored and maintained in the 28 29 State DNA databank established pursuant to the "DNA Database and Databank Act of 1994," P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.17 et seq.) <sup>1</sup>and 30 shall be forwarded to the FBI for inclusion in CODIS<sup>1</sup>. <sup>1</sup>[The division 31 32 shall have the discretion to determine how the evidence is retained 33 pursuant to this section, provided that the evidence is retained in a 34 condition suitable for DNA testing.]<sup>1</sup>

- <sup>1</sup>[b. The division may dispose of biological material before the expiration of the period of time described in subsection a. if all the conditions set forth below are met:
- 38 (1) The division notifies all of the following persons of the 39 provisions of this section and of the intention of the division to dispose 40 of the material: any person who as a result of a conviction in the case 41 is currently serving a term of imprisonment and who remains 42 incarcerated in connection with the case; any counsel of record; the 43 public defender in the county of the conviction; the prosecutor in the 44 county of the conviction and the Attorney General.
- 45 (2) The division does not receive, within 90 days of sending the

1 notification, any of the following:

- (a) A copy of the motion filed pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill), however, upon filing of that motion, the division shall retain the material only until the time that the court's denial of the motion is final.
- (b) A sworn request that the material not be destroyed or disposed of because the declarant will file within 180 days a motion for DNA testing pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill) that is followed within 180 days by a copy of the motion for DNA testing pursuant to section c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill), unless a request for an extension is requested by the convicted person and agreed to by the governmental entity in possession of the evidence.
  - (c) A copy of a sworn declaration of innocence that has been filed with the court within 180 days of the judgment of conviction. However, the court shall permit the destruction of the evidence upon a showing that the declaration is false or there is no issue of identity that would be affected by additional testing. The convicted person may be cross-examined on the declaration at any hearing conducted pursuant to this section or on an application by or on behalf of the convicted person pursuant to section 1 of P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as section 1 of this bill).
  - (3) No other provision of law requires that biological evidence be preserved or retained.]<sup>1</sup>
  - <sup>1</sup>[c]b<sup>1</sup>. The <sup>1</sup>[division] Attorney General<sup>1</sup> shall adopt rules governing the procedures to be used in the analysis and storage of DNA <sup>1</sup>[samples and DNA testing results submitted pursuant] <sup>1</sup> profile information obtained in accordance with the provisions of <sup>1</sup> P.L. c. , (C. )(now pending before the Legislature as this bill).

3. The Supreme Court of New Jersey may adopt rules appropriate and necessary to effectuate the purpose of this act.

4. This act shall take effect on the <sup>1</sup>[120th] 180th day after enactment <sup>1</sup>, but the Attorney General may take such anticipatory administrative action in advance as shall be necessary for the implementation of the act <sup>1</sup>.

\_\_\_\_\_

Provides for post-conviction DNA testing; allows post-conviction DNA profile information to be used in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes.

#### **CHAPTER 377**

**AN ACT** concerning certain testing of evidence and supplementing Title 2A and Title 53 of the New Jersey Statutes.

**BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

C.2A:84A-32a Motion for performance of forensic DNA testing, certain circumstances.

- 1. a. Any person who was convicted of a crime and is currently serving a term of imprisonment may make a motion before the trial court that entered the judgment of conviction for the performance of forensic DNA testing.
- (1) The motion shall be verified by the convicted person under penalty of perjury and shall do all of the following:
  - (a) explain why the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case;
- (b) explain in light of all the evidence, how if the results of the requested DNA testing are favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted;
- (c) explain whether DNA testing was done at any prior time, whether the defendant objected to providing a biological sample for DNA testing, and whether the defendant objected to the admissibility of DNA testing evidence at trial. If evidence was subjected to DNA or other forensic testing previously by either the prosecution or the defense, the court shall order the prosecution or defense to provide all parties and the court with access to the laboratory reports, underlying data and laboratory notes prepared in connection with the DNA testing;
- (d) make every reasonable attempt to identify both the evidence that should be tested and the specific type of DNA testing sought; and
  - (e) include consent to provide a biological sample for DNA testing.
- (2) Notice of the motion shall be served on the Attorney General, the prosecutor in the county of conviction, and if known, the governmental agency or laboratory holding the evidence sought to be tested. Responses, if any, shall be filed within 60 days of the date on which the Attorney General and the prosecutor are served with the motion, unless a continuance is granted. The Attorney General or prosecutor may support the motion for DNA testing or oppose it with a statement of reasons and may recommend to the court that if any DNA testing is ordered, a particular type of testing be conducted.
- b. The court, in its discretion, may order a hearing on the motion. The motion shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial unless the presiding judge determines that judge is unavailable. Upon request of either party, the court may order, in the interest of justice, that the convicted person be present at the hearing of the motion.
- c. The court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person who brings a motion pursuant to this section if that person is indigent.
- d. The court shall not grant the motion for DNA testing unless, after conducting a hearing,it determines that all of the following have been established:
- (1) the evidence to be tested is available and in a condition that would permit the DNA testing that is requested in the motion;
- (2) the evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish it has not been substituted, tampered with, replaced or altered in any material aspect;
  - (3) the identity of the defendant was a significant issue in the case;
- (4) the convicted person has made a prima facie showing that the evidence sought to be tested is material to the issue of the convicted person's identity as the offender;
- (5) the requested DNA testing result would raise a reasonable probability that if the results were favorable to the defendant, a motion for a new trial based upon newly discovered evidence would be granted. The court in its discretion may consider any evidence whether or not it was introduced at trial;
  - (6) the evidence sought to be tested meets either of the following conditions:
  - (a) it was not tested previously;
- (b) it was tested previously, but the requested DNA test would provide results that are reasonably more discriminating and probative of the identity of the offender or have a reasonable probability of contradicting prior test results;
- (7) the testing requested employs a method generally accepted within the relevant scientific community; and

- (8) the motion is not made solely for the purpose of delay.
- e. If the court grants the motion for DNA testing, the court order shall identify the specific evidence to be tested and the DNA technology to be used. (1) If the parties agree upon a mutually acceptable laboratory that is accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with national standards issued pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. s.14131 from the National Forensic Science Technology Center, the testing shall be conducted by that laboratory.
- (2) If the parties fail to agree, the testing shall be conducted by the New Jersey State Police Forensic Science Laboratory. For good cause shown, however, the court may direct the evidence to an alternative laboratory that is accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors Laboratory Accreditation Board or a laboratory that has a certificate of compliance with national standards issued pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. s.14131 from the National Forensic Science Technology Center.
- f. The result of any testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be fully disclosed to the person filing the motion, the prosecutor and the Attorney General. If requested by any party, the court shall order production of the underlying laboratory data and notes.
- g. The costs of the DNA testing ordered pursuant to this section shall be borne by the convicted person.
- h. An order granting or denying a motion for DNA testing pursuant to this section may be appealed, pursuant to the Rules of Court.
- i. DNA testing ordered by the court pursuant to this section shall be done as soon as practicable.
- j. DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to a motion for post-conviction DNA testing in accordance with the provisions of this section shall be treated as confidential and shall not be deemed a public record under P.L.1963, c.73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) or the common law concerning access to public records; except as provided in section 2 of P.L.2001, c.377 (C.53:1-20.37).
- k. As used in this act, the terms "DNA," "DNA sample," DNA databank," "CODIS" and "FBI" shall have the meaning set forth in section 3 of P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.19).

#### C.53:1-20.37 Retaining of all DNA profile information.

- 2. a. Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, the Division of State Police in the Department of Law and Public Safety shall retain all DNA profile information from biological samples taken from a convicted person pursuant to the provisions of section 1 of P.L.2001, c.377 (C.2A:84A-32a) and may use the profile information in the investigation and prosecution of other crimes. The DNA profile information shall be added to,stored and maintained in the State DNA databank established pursuant to the "DNA Database and Databank Act of 1994," P.L.1994, c.136 (C.53:1-20.17 et seq.) and shall be forwarded to the FBI for inclusion in CODIS.
- b. The Attorney General shall adopt rules governing the procedures to be used in the analysis and storage of DNA profile information obtained in accordance with the provisions of P.L.2001, c.377 (C.2A:84A-32a et al.).

#### C.2A:84A-32b Rules.

- 3. The Supreme Court of New Jersey may adopt rules appropriate and necessary to effectuate the purpose of this act.
- 4. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after enactment, but the Attorney General may take such anticipatory administrative action in advance as shall be necessary for the implementation of the act

Approved January 8, 2002.